Categories	Point structure		Distributech's Scores	Distributech	LAW's Scores	LAW
	Total Points to Start	Points to be reduced for each section if there are concerns				
Risks	5			5		5
Construction		-1.7		0	Distributech proposal is a completely new build out. As they are relying on Stahlman Group and W&H systems to design and construct this warehouse system, there is a risk of missing the deadlines, but with minimal automation, there is little concern here.	-0.5	LAW has proposed in the BAFO to reduce the automation and install basic racking systems.
Equipment Procurement		-1.7		0	No Issues	0	No Issues
Integration		-1.7		-1.7	Distributech has no proven experience in this market and with new systems that would need to modeled, developed and tested there is concern that they would be successful.	0	No Issues
			Sub Total	3.3		Sub Total	4.5
Proposed Automation	5		Total Start	5		Total Start	5
Level of automation					Distributech has a low level of automation proposed here. They plan on using labor to due the bulk of the warehouse stock movement. This will be inefficient as the warehouse grows.		LAW has shown very little addition to their current automation. They still plan on using their current legacy WMS. I have concerns that they understand the level of integration needed and the vision to grow NHSLC's business model. LAW is relying on its labor force to reach a successful warehouse.
Hi Automation (80%)		0					
Medium Automation (50%)		-1					
Low Automation (30%)		-3		-3	X	-3	X
			Sub Total	2		Sub Total	2
Ability to Implementation	5		Total Start	5		Total Start	5
Proven Experience		-1.7		-1.7	Distributech has not done anything of this magnitude. It is unclear as to their ability that they can meet the schedule and sustain the environment once it is in production. I have concerns that they are relying on an outside vendor to be successful in this contract.	0	As LAW has not done anything of this magnitude it is unclear as to their ability that they can meet the schedule and sustain the environment once it is in production. I have concerns that they have projected the current legacy system going forward and has great hesitation to any changes that may occur in the NHSLC going forward.
IT Support		-1.7		-1.7	The concern here is that Distributech an IT staff of one person. This does not afford redundancy and bench strength. The concern her is that with any increase in systems complexity or volume that one person will not be able to support this environment.	-1	The concern here is that LAW's IT staff is 1 person. This does not afford redundancy and bench strength. The concern her is that with any increase in systems complexity or volume that 1 person will not be able to support this environment.

Category	Points			Score	Distributech Comments		Score	LAW Comments
Systems Integration Solution		-1.7		-1.7	The system integration solution that is being proposed is untried in this area. Although it has been used in other states, the new relationship between the vendors and Distributech puts this proposal at risk.		0	LAW in the BAFO downgraded his system to a more manual environment and will be utilizing his current system. It should continue to work as it has in the past.
			Sub Total	-0.1		Sub Total	4	
Proposed WMS	**5**		**Total Start**	**5**		**Total Start**	**5**	
Understanding Business requirements		-1.25		-1.25	Distributech has responded in an affirmative way that it understands the business requirements and feels that it has provided a sound solution to the RFP. The vendors that have been partnered with are of sufficient breadth in the WMS space that they are adequate to support Distributech's proposal. The concern is with a new relationship and an untried partnership there is concerns that raise questions on overall scope of understanding by Distributech.		-0.75	Even though LAW has had NHSLC's business for many years their understanding of the requirements seem lacking. They have taken exception to all of Appendix K, and have had issues with understanding that this RFP might move them from the current model. I have concerns that they grasp the magnitude of this endeavor.
Software Solution		-1.25		0	The software solution that is being proposed is the one that is currently being used. The concern is that the system may not be able to grow with the business and that any changes to the current NHSLC business model may over tax this system.		-1	The software solution that is being proposed is the one that is currently being used. The concern is that the system may not be able to grow with the business and that any changes to the current NHSLC business model may over tax this system.
Flexibility		-1.25		0	Distributech has shown that it can be flexible and is willing to work with the NHSLC.		-1	LAW has voiced concern that changes would be difficult and potentially costly. With the exceptions that have been taken to Appendix K. There are concerns that changes would be handle smoothly.
Preparation for Day 1		-1.25		0	No Issues		0	No Issues
			Sub Total	3.75		Sub Total	2.25	
Total Points available	20	Grand Total		8.95		Grand Total	12.75	Grand Total

		Companies		
Hat Trick's Scores	**Hat Trick**	**XTL Scores**	**XTL**	**EXEL Scores**
Total Start 5		Total Start 5		Total Start 5
0	Hat Trick has proposed in the BAFO to reduce the automation and install basic racking systems. There is little concerns.	0	There equipment has to be manufactured and they have secured confirmations from the vendors can erect the systems on time.	0
0	No Issues	-1.7	There equipment has to be manufactured and they have secured confirmations from the vendors that the equipment will be delivered on time. In the went that the schedule slips from the September 12th date for any reason, this procurement will be at serious risk and could cause a significant production schedule slip.	0
-1.7	The Vermont system is not been used with the NHSLC to date. It appears that if it does not work that Hat Trick will propose a different product. This is a concern that it could impact the schedule.	0	XTL's proposed a COTS product and is open data compliant with a good track record of implementations. No issues here.	0
Sub Total 3.3		**Sub Total 3.3**		**Sub Total 5**
Total Start 5		Total Start 5		Total Start 5
	They have offer lower level of automation and plan on using a WMS system to manage inventory, but will rely heavily on human collateral. This causes some concern in the over all technology costs and ability to scale to increased business demands of the NHSLC.		XTL has proposed a high level automation. Their proposal is the most automated and shows the need to be able to limit human involvement with stock receiving, put away and pick, pack and ship. This will offer the most efficient use of warehouse space and over the 20 years save in labor costs.	
		0	X	
				-1
-3	X			
Sub Total 2		**Sub Total 5**		**Sub Total 4**
Total Start 5		Total Start 5		Total Start 5
-1.7	Concerns exists with HT's ability to implement. As stated earlier they have proposed a system that they say could be changed if it does not work. This might cause business disruption. The plan to do business requirements, develop, test and migrate into production a working WMS system in time is a concern.	0	XTL has installed this environment in other states and has a good track record of success. I see minimal exposure of them hitting the production go live target.	0
0	Hat Trick Seems to have an adequate IT group.	0	They have a solid IT team with a proven track record. Even though it lacks depth it is adequately staffed.	0

Score	Hat Trick Comments		Score	XTL Comments		Score
0	Hat Trick has minimal automation and a COTS product for their application. If the Vermont system works than HT appears to be able to integrate adequately.		0	XTL has proposed Robocom's WMS solution. It is a full function system that will integrate with our current system. They have had experience implementing this environment before and I see no issues in this area. My only concern here would be the equipment being ready to accept this software due to construction delays.		0
Sub Total 3.3			**Sub Total** 5			**Sub Total** 5
Total Start 5			**Total Start** 5			**Total Start** 5
0	Hat Trick seems to have a good understanding of the RFP's requirements. Although they are a beer warehouse operation they believe that they can adapt to wine and spirits environment easily. They have no exceptions to the technical requirements and in discussions have shown that they understand what is being asked.		0	XTL has a good understanding of the RFP's requirements. They have no exceptions to the technical requirements and in discussions have shown that they understand what is being asked.		0
-1.25	They have proposed a system that they say could be changed if it does not work. This might cause business disruption.		0	XTL has proposed Robocom's WMS solution. It is a full function system that will integrate with our current system.		0
0	Hat Trick has taken no exceptions to Appendix K and seems to have been very open to future changes.		0	XTL has taken no exceptions to Appendix K and seems to have been very open to future changes.		0
0	No Issue		-1.25	The only concern here is that the equipment is not procured in time and is late being setup and configured		0
Sub Total 3.75			**Sub Total** 3.75			**Sub Total** 5
12.35	**Grand Total**		17.05	**Grand Total**		19

EXEL

As EXCEL is not as automated the racking systems are less complicated and will not require more than normal construction.

There equipment has to be manufactured and they have secured confirmations from the vendors that the equipment will be delivered on time and erected on time.

EXEL is using the Manhaten application and will setup and test the system well be for it was needed. No Issues here.

EXEL has proposed a medium to high level of automation. Their proposal is investing in automation and shows the savings in over all labor costs. They have a sound technical proposal, a very deep IT bench strength and have an effective WMS solution.

X

EXEL has a centralized environment that affords them the ability to develop, test and project into a new warehouse on day one. They of all the proposals have the strongest IT team and the most sound proposal. They would be ready to go into production before the building was ready. With the global experience that they possess in warehousing, this would be an graceful implementation for them.

EXEL has a very deep bench of skill sets. They have a team that is setup to perform the implementation of the warehouse and applications. I see not concerns here.

EXEL's integration solution is very sound. As they have a
centrally distributed model, they have mitigated last minute
issues by having the NHSLC's environment stood up and
tested well before go live. They have also a disaster recovery
plan that is unique and beneficial to the NHSLC business
continuity plan.

EXCEL has a very good understanding of the RFP's
requirements. They have no exceptions to the technical
requirements and in discussions have shown that they
understand what is being asked and has offered a world class
solution to the NHSLC's business model for the current
environment and for the future.

EXEL has proposed the Mahattan warehouse management
solution for this project. It is a premier product and can
completely model the NHSLC's business well before actual go
live and therefore work out any issues. They have proposed a
solid solution. As discussed earlier, they also have a remote
disaster recovery site as well.

EXEL has proposed Manhattan WMS solution. It is a full
function system that will integrate with our current system.

No Concerns here.