

FINAL REPORT MAINE-NEW HAMPSHIRE CONNECTIONS STUDY



Prepared for

**Maine Department of Transportation
New Hampshire Department of Transportation**



January 31, 2011

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	ES-1
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND STUDY BACKGROUND.....	1-1
CHAPTER 2: PUBLIC OUTREACH PROCESS.....	2-1
2.1. Study Committees	2-1
2.2. Summary of Steering and Stakeholder Committee Meetings	2-3
2.3. Summary of Public Information Meetings.....	2-7
2.4. Summary of Public Meeting Comments	2-12
2.5. Summary of Other Meetings	2-12
2.6. Summary of Section 106 Consultation Meetings	2-17
2.7. Maine Programmatic Agreement with State and Federal Agencies.....	2-19
2.8. Maine and New Hampshire Gubernatorial Task Force.....	2-19
CHAPTER 3: STUDY PURPOSE AND NEED	3-1
CHAPTER 4: STUDY PROCESS AND SUMMARY OF FATAL FLAW ANALYSIS	4-1
4.1. Study Process	4-1
4.2. Identification of Fatal Flaw Alternatives	4-3
4.3. Fatal Flaw Analysis Process	4-10
4.4. Fatal Flaw Analysis Results	4-12
4.5. Summary of Fatal Flaw Analysis	4-17
4.6. Supplemental Alternatives (Post Fatal Flaw Report)	4-20
CHAPTER 5: BRIDGE INSPECTION SUMMARY.....	5-1
5.1. Memorial Bridge.....	5-1
5.2. Sarah Mildred Long Bridge.....	5-7
CHAPTER 6: EVALUATION AND ANALYSIS TASKS	6-1
6.1. Engineering Analysis	6-1
6.2. Marine Navigation Evaluation	6-3
6.3. Crash Evaluation	6-7
6.4. Origin and Destination Analysis	6-8
6.5. Traffic Analysis	6-14
6.6. Multimodal Evaluation.....	6-31
6.7. Air Quality Analysis.....	6-37
6.8. Noise Analysis.....	6-39
6.9. Natural Resource Impact Evaluation	6-43
6.10. Physical Resource Impact Evaluation	6-51
6.11. Land Use Impact Evaluation	6-52
6.12. Historic Impact Evaluation	6-60

6.13. Archaeological Impact Evaluation	6-64
6.14. Preliminary Level Cost Analysis	6-64
6.15. Business Impact Assessment	6-73
6.16. Environmental Clearances Assessment	6-76
CHAPTER 7: DEVELOPMENT OF EVALUATION CRITERIA and MEASURES OF EFFECTIVENESS (MOEs)	7-1
7.1. Structural Improvement	7-2
7.2. Mobility for the Year 2035	7-2
7.3. Accessibility	7-5
7.4. Planning Level Cost Estimates	7-7
7.5. Historic (Section 106)	7-9
7.6. Natural Environment	7-11
7.7. Physical Environment	7-13
7.8. Environmental Clearances	7-15
7.9. Use of Section 4(f) Properties	7-15
CHAPTER 8: RESULTS OF DETAILED EVALUATION OF ALTERNATIVES	8-1
8.1. No Build Alternative	8-1
8.2. Alternative 1: MB1 + SL1	8-3
8.3. Alternative 2a and 2b: MB1 + SL2 – 2-lane and 4-lane	8-3
8.4. Alternative 3a and 3b: MB1 + SL2A – 2-lane and 4-lane	8-8
8.5. Alternative 4: MB2 + SL1	8-8
8.6. Alternative 5a: MB2 + SL2 – 2-lane	8-13
8.7. Alternative 5b: MB2 + SL2 – 4-lane	8-17
8.8. Alternative 6a: MB2 + SL2A – 2-lane	8-23
8.9. Alternative 6b: MB2 + SL2A – 4-lane	8-26
8.10. Alternative 7: MB6 + SL2 – 4-lane	8-30
8.11. Alternative 8: MB6 + SL2A – 4-lane	8-35
8.12. Alternative 9: MB2 + SL2B – 2-lane hybrid	8-39
8.13. Alternative 10: MB6 + SL2B – 2-lane hybrid	8-44
8.14. Alternative 11: MB7 + SL2C – 2-lane hybrid	8-49
CHAPTER 9: STUDY RESULTS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	9-1
9.1. Environmental Approvals	9-1
9.2. Preliminary Section 4(f) Evaluation	9-1
9.3. Alternatives Dismissed from Further Consideration	9-2
9.4. Alternatives Recommended to be Carried Forward	9-5
9.5. Documentation for Remaining Alternatives	9-7
9.6. Conclusions/Recommendations	9-8
9.7. Next Steps	9-8

LIST OF TABLES

Table 4-1: Listing of the 63 Fatal Flaw Analysis Alternatives	4-6
Table 4-2: Listing of the 34 Alternatives Eliminated in Round 1	4-12
Table 4-3: Listing of the 14 Alternatives Eliminated in Round 2	4-15
Table 4-4: Listing of the 6 Alternatives Eliminated in Round 3	4-17
Table 5-1: Memorial Bridge – 2009 Conditions Summary Table	5-3
Table 5-2: Memorial Bridge – 2010 Conditions Summary Table	5-4
Table 5-3: Sarah Mildred Long Bridge Approach Spans – 2009 Condition Summary Table	5-8
Table 5-4: Sarah Mildred Long Bridge Truss Spans – 2009 Condition Summary Table	5-9
Table 6-1: Bridge Horizontal and Vertical Clearances	6-3
Table 6-2: Number of Lifts for 2008	6-4
Table 6-3: Interview Sample Summary	6-9
Table 6-4: Population, Household, & Employment Trends in Kittery, Maine	6-16
Table 6-5: Population, Household, & Employment Trends in Portsmouth, NH	6-16
Table 6-6: Signalized Intersection Capacity & Analysis Summary	6-21
Table 6-7: Unsignalized Intersection Capacity & Analysis Summary	6-23
Table 6-8: 2009 Existing Bridge Capacity Analysis	6-25
Table 6-9: 2035 Bridge Capacity Analyses – No Build	6-26
Table 6-10: 2035 Bridge Capacity Analyses – Build 1	6-27
Table 6-11: 2035 Bridge Capacity Analyses – Build 2 and 3 With Two-Lifts	6-28
Table 6-12: Estimate Percent of Bicycle and Pedestrian Trips to Shift to Transit	6-37
Table 6-13: Noise Abatement Criteria	6-40
Table 6-14: Noise Monitoring Data	6-41
Table 6-15: Modeled Sound Levels	6-42
Table 6-16: Summary of Life-Cycle Cost by Alternative	6-70
Table 6-17: Summary of Benefit-Cost Cost Ratios by Alternative	6-72

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure #	Name	Page #
1-1	Study Area Map	1-1
6-1	Height of Lifts: Sarah Mildred Long Bridge	6-5
6-2	Height of Lifts: Memorial Bridge	6-6
6-3	Locations of High Safety Concern	6-8
6-4	State of Registration Summary	6-10
6-5	Average Trip Length, by Bridge	6-10
6-6	Trip Purpose by Bridge	6-11
6-7	Bridge Crossing Transport Type	6-13
6-8	Trip Type Summary, Weekends vs. Weekdays	6-14
6-9	Traffic Study Area	6-15
6-10	2009 & 2035 Bridge Volumes	6-18
6-11	Proposed Bus Transit System Route and Station Stops	6-36
6-12	Special Aquatic Sites map	6-44
6-13	Surface Waters and Groundwater Features map	6-47
6-14	Natural Communities map	6-48
6-15	FEMA Special Flood Hazard Areas map	6-50
6-16	Geology map	6-53
6-17	Community Facilities - Kittery	6-54
6-18	Community Facilities - Portsmouth	6-55
6-19	Activity Centers - Kittery	6-57
6-20	Activity Centers - Portsmouth	6-58
6-21	Land Use map	6-59
6-22	Historical Resources - Kittery	6-62
6-23	Historical Resources - Portsmouth	6-63
6-24	Areas of Archeological Potential – US 1 Bypass Portsmouth, NH	6-65
6-25	Areas of Archeological Potential – US 1 Bypass Kittery, ME	6-66
6-26	Areas of Archeological Potential – US 1 Bypass Kittery, ME	6-67

6-27	Areas of Archeological Potential – US 1 Portsmouth, NH	6-68
6-28	Areas of Archeological Potential – US 1 Kittery, ME	6-69
6-29	Survey Area Map with Zones	6-73
8-1	No Build Alternative: Plan and Typical Section	8-4
8-2	Alternative 1: Plan and Typical Sections	8-5
8-3	Alternative 2a: Plan and Typical Sections	8-6
8-4	Alternative 2b: Plan and Typical Sections	8-7
8-5	Alternative 3a: Plan and Typical Sections	8-9
8-6	Alternative 3b: Plan and Typical Sections	8-10
8-7	Alternative 4: Plan and Typical Sections	8-14
8-8	Alternative 5a: Plan and Typical Sections	8-18
8-9	Alternative 5b: Plan and Typical Sections	8-22
8-10	Alternative 6a: Plan and Typical Sections	8-27
8-11	Alternative 6b: Plan and Typical Sections	8-31
8-12	Alternative 7: Plan and Typical Sections	8-36
8-13	Alternative 8: Plan and Typical Sections	8-40
8-14	Alternative 9: Plan and Typical Sections	8-45
8-15	Alternative 10: Plan and Typical Sections	8-50
8-16	Alternative 11: Plan and Typical Sections	8-55
8-17	Sarah Mildred Long Hybrid Bridge - Lift Span Elevations	8-56
8-18	Feasible Alternatives Evaluation Matrix	8-57

Index of Appendices

Appendix #	Tech Memo/ Tech Report#	Title	Status
1	1	Balanced Traffic and Seasonal Volume Adjustment	Included
2	2	Crash Data Compilation and Summary	Included
3	3	Navigational Needs of the Piscataqua River	Included
4	4	Multi Modal Existing Conditions	Included
5	5	Seasonal Adjustment Factor Calculation	Included
6	6	No Build Adjustments to Peak Hour Bridge Volumes	Included
7	7	Memorial and Long Bridge Capacity	N/A*
8	8	Socio Economic Conditions and Future Projections	Included
9	9	Land Use Base Conditions	Included
10	10	Interstate 95 Bridge Capacity	N/A*
11	11	Mid and High Level Bridge Capacity	N/A*
12	12	Existing Conditions Noise	Included
13	13	Travel Demand Results for Fatal Flaw	N/A*
14	14	Existing Conditions Traffic Analysis	Included
15	15	Memorial Bridge Closed Traffic Assessment	Included
16	16	Pedestrian Bicycle Assessment with Memorial Closed	Included
17	17	Preliminary Impact Analysis	Included
18	18	Benefit Cost Methodology	Included
19	19	Closure of Bridges During Construction	Included
20	20	2035 Bridge Capacity	N/A*
21	21	Traffic Analysis Criteria	Included
22	22	Future Noise Conditions	Included
23	23	2035 Traffic Operational Analysis	Included
24	24	Future Air Quality Analysis	Included
25	25	Multi Modal Evaluation	Included
26	26	Baseline Growth and Summary	Included
27	27	Future Bridge Capacities under Various Alternatives	N/A*
28	28	2015 Construction Impacts	Included
29	29	Traffic Forecasts Summary	Included
30	30	Life Cycle Cost Analysis	Included
31	31	Additional Bridge Capacity Analysis	N/A*
32	32	Transit Alternative Assessment	Included
33	33	Travel Demand Model Methodology	Included
34	34	Special Aquatic Sites Impact Memo	Included
35	35	Endangered Species Impact Memo	Included
36	36	Property Resource Impact Tech Memo	Included
37	37	Surface Water Resource Impact Tech Memo	Included
38	38	Habitat Resource Impact Tech Memo	Included
39	39	FEMA Resource Impact Tech Memo	Included

40	40	Soils and Geology Resource Impact Tech Memo	Included
41	Technical Report # 1	Connections Origin-Destination Survey, Summary Report	Included
42	Technical Report #2	Connections Pedestrian and Bicycle Origin and Destination Survey, Summary Report	Included
43	Technical Report #3	Fatal Flaw Report and Documentation	Included
44	Technical Report #4	Customer and Business Survey Results: Final Report	Included
45	Technical Report #5	Bridge Capacity Analysis Summary Report	Included
46		Memorial Bridge Condition Summary	Included
47		Sarah Long Bridge Condition Summary	Included
48		Memorial Bridge Inspection Report and Sarah Mildred Long Inspection Report Websites	Included
49		Public Meeting Minutes	Included
50		Steering and Stakeholder Committee Meeting Minutes	Included
51		Other Meeting Minutes	Included
52		Section 106/Consulting Parties Meeting Minutes	Included
53		Engineering Design Criteria Memorandum	Included
54		Summary Report on Historic Resources	Included
55		Summary Report on Archeological Sensitivity Assessment	Included
56		Maine's Programmatic Agreement with State and Federal Agencies	Included
57		Governor's Executive Order	Included
58		MaineDOT Determination of Effects	Included
59		NEPA Document Terms	Included
60		Bi-State Bridge Funding Task Force- Final Report	Included
61		Comments and responses received on Draft Final Report	Included

* - These technical memoranda were superseded by Appendix #45 (Technical Report #5)

ACRONYMS

- AASHTO – American Association of State Highway and Transportation Officials
- ACHP – Advisory Council on Historic Preservation
- ACS – American Community Survey
- ADT – Average Daily Traffic
- APE - Area of Potential Effect
- AREMA – American Railway Engineering and Maintenance-of-Way Association
- ATR - Automatic Traffic Recorder
- BICA – Bridge Inspection and Cost Analysis
- BM – Boston and Maine Corporation
- CE – Categorical Exclusion
- CFR – Code of Federal Regulations
- CO – Carbon Monoxide
- COAST - Cooperative Alliance for Seacoast Transportation
- CRF – Critical Rate Factor
- dbA – Decibel A
- DEP – Department of Environmental Protection
- DES – Department of Environmental Services
- DOE – Determination of Effects
- DOT’S – Departments of Transportation
- EA – Environmental Assessment
- ECG - East Coast Greenway
- EFH – Essential Fish Habitat
- EIS – Environmental Impact Statement
- EPA – Environmental Protection Agency
- ET – Eastern Trail
- FEMA – Federal Emergency Management Agency
- FHWA – Federal Highway Administration
- FPPA – Farmland Protection Policy Act
- FRA – Federal Railroad Administration
- FTA – Federal Transit Administration
- GIS – Geographic Information System
- HCL – High Crash Location
- HCM – Highway Capacity Manual
- HDR – HDR Engineering, Inc.
- HNTB – HNTB Corporation
- HOV – High Occupancy Vehicle
- Hoyle, Tanner - Hoyle Tanner and Associates, Inc

- IBA – Interstate Bridge Authority
- lb - pound
- LCCA – Life Cycle Cost Analysis
- LMA – Labor Market Area
- LOS – Level of Service
- LRFR - Load Resistant Factored Rating
- MaineDOT – Maine Department of Transportation
- MBTA – Massachusetts Bay Transportation Authority
- MB – Memorial Bridge
- MEGIS – Maine’s Office of Geographic Information Systems
- MHPC – Maine Historic Preservation Commission
- MOA – Memorandum of Agreement
- MOE - Measure of Effectiveness
- mph – miles per hour
- MRSA – Maine Revised Statutes Annotated
- NAAQS – National Ambient Air Quality Standard
- NAC – Noise Abatement Criteria
- NBIS – National Bridge Inspection Standards
- NEPA – National Environmental Policy Act
- NGVD - National Geodetic Vertical Datum
- NH DHR – New Hampshire Division of Historic Resources
- NH DOT – New Hampshire Department of Transportation
- NH GRANIT – New Hampshire Geographically Referenced Analysis and Information Transfer System
- NH RSA - New Hampshire Revised Statutes Annotated
- NHS – National Highway System (Federal funding category & established system of roads)
- NHSG – New Hampshire Seacoast Greenway
- NHSHPO – New Hampshire State Historic Preservation Office
- NMFS – National Marine Fisheries Service
- NNEPRA – Northern New England Passenger Rail Authority
- NOAA – National Oceanographic and Atmospheric Administration
- NR – National Register
- NRCS - National Resource Conservation Service
- NRHP - National Register of Historic Places
- NWI – National Wetlands Inventory
- O&D – Origin and Destination
- O&M - Operation and Maintenance

- PAR – Pan Am Railway
- P&N – Purpose and Need
- PHF – peak hour factor
- PM – Particulate Matter
- PNSY – Portsmouth Naval Shipyard
- Q&A – Question and Answer
- R&R – Capital Repair and Rehabilitation
- ROW – Right of Way
- RSA – Revised Statutes Annotated
- SHPO – State Historic Preservation Office
- SML – Sarah Mildred Long Bridge
- STPA – Maine’s Sensible Transportation Policy Act
- STRY – Springfield Terminal Railway Company
- TAZ – Traffic Analysis Zone
- T&E – Threatened and Endangered Species
- TIGER - Transportation Investment Generating Economic Recovery
- TNM - Traffic Noise Model
- USACOE - United States Army Corps of Engineers
- USCG - United States Coast Guard
- USDA - United States Department of Agriculture
- USDOT – United States Department of Transportation
- USFWS – United States Fish and Wildlife Service
- USGS – United States Geologic Survey
- V/C – Volume to Capacity
- VHT – Vehicle Hours Traveled
- VMT – Vehicle Miles Traveled
- vph – Vehicles per hour
- YCCAC – York County Community Action Center